

June 20, 2011 (Monday)

Pre-Congress Seminars

KEMPINSKI HOTEL CORVINUS
REGINA BALLROOM II.

Erzsébet tér 7-8, Budapest V.
Monday 10:00 – 16:00

3.2. QUALITY IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

Session Chair: *Viktor Horváth, Ministry of Public Administration and Justice, Hungary*

12.35 Implementation of Quality Monitoring Systems for Delivery of Public Service to Population of the Republic of Kazakhstan

Azat Abdrakhmanov, Gleb Lukin and Valentina Yurikova, International Association of Quality Managers and Auditors, Kazakhstan

Abdrakhmanov, Azat A. (Kazakhstan)

Born in 1949 in Kazakhstan he finished Almaty National Medical Institute, Faculty of Medical Business. His qualification: Doctor. In 1977 he became Doctor of Medical Science and in 1996 Professor of Medicine. He has a lot of qualifications e.g. in the following fields: Quality Certification Auditor; Expert Auditor for National System for Technical Regulation, ISO 9001 Certification; Lead Third Party Quality Auditor; EFQM Excellence Assessor; SGS Lead Auditor. Beginning from 1996 he is the President of Association of Automatic Identification, Kazakhstan and since 2005 President and Auditor of «InterCert» Certification Center, Ltd. In this position he is responsible for management of the activity on certification of quality management systems (ISO 9001, ISO 14001, OHSAS 18001) as well as personnel and product certification. He took part in several theoretical and practical trainings including EFQM Excellence Assessor Training in 2010.

Implementation of quality monitoring systems for delivery of public service to population of the Republic of Kazakhstan

Azat Abdrakhmanov (azat@standard.kz), Gleb Lukin (lukin@letograf.ru),
Valentina Yurikova (info@standard.kz)

International Association of Quality Managers and Auditors (IAQMA, Kazakhstan)

Key Words

Quality in Public Sector, Quality Management, Centers for Public Services

Introduction.

Creation of Centers for Public Service (CPS) in Astana and Almaty in November 2005 is one of the most important direction for Central and Local Executive Authority of the Republic of Kazakhstan. This activity is undertaken with the aim to create and maintain qualitatively new relationship with the population of Kazakhstan that submits different queries on service provision to public organizations.

Development and approval of standards for provision of public service as well as opportunity in terms of obtaining the most of the services from single institution without any direct visiting of many public organizations. This enables to exclude unfounded expectations in queue and also time costs incurred by population with regard to receiving replies to their queries and finally people do not need to multiply address the same institutions. There is no need to involve the population and organizations into development, harmonization or obtaining of many duplicated documents that simplifies procedures for their interaction with the Central and Executive authority bodies.

Automatization and creation of the monitoring system for public service quality enable to reduce opportunities for corruption by some of the government employees. The population of Kazakhstan demonstrates considerable interest in public service quality delivered by different government organizations as this impacts citizens' ability to implement their constitutional rights.

General Overview.

The successful activity is currently conducted in Kazakhstan on implementation of the «Single Window» approach within the executive authority bodies: the procedure for applicant treatment that ensures issuance of requested documents listed in Unified Document Register. This system of interaction increases transparency and simplifies existing practices in processing applications and at the same time enables to decrease the time frame for development and issuance of documents. The applicants are not requested to arrange any supporting agreements and thus they can save their energy and time for obtaining necessary document.

Specifically trained professionals of CPS and other public organizations have adapted new approaches to applicant's document management. Each of the all-purpose specialists have a very strong knowledge in terms of requirements that regulate acceptance and issuance of documents as well as clear understanding of the procedure for preparation of the requested documents. They accept and issue documents arranged by not only local authority but also several ministries and institutions based on signed contracts on collaboration.

The register of institutional documents that can be obtained at CPS includes 74 types of public services. This number is increased on a regular basis. The automated information system that is used by CPS have been developed by professionals of Letograph Ltd in compliance with standardized analysis of public services, analytical reports developed by IAQMA specialists enables to optimize the procedures for provision of many public services delivered by different public organizations through development of flow-charts based on application of ARIS method for each service.

As a result the timeframe of consideration of applications was minimized while quality and completeness of requested documents as well as those submitted to different public organization for execution have been taken under stringent control and regulation. This approach guarantees the CPS employees' proficiency and responsibility. Implementation of the project in 2010 enabled increased document management performance, provision of current control of compliance with the time limits for fulfillment of the requests as well as CPS employees' performance.

A regularly updated information package is placed on Internet portal of CPS that provides detailed information on CPS activity including performance of «Single Window», municipal authority bodies and other organizations, contact information, operational schedules, location and e-mails of the units. In addition to reference information the users can familiarize themselves with the application blank forms and lists of documents to be submitted to the «Single Window» unit. Using their registration number the users can obtain operational information on application processing status.

The project was implemented by International Association of Quality Managers and Auditors (IAQMA, Kazakhstan) in collaboration with Letograph Ltd (Russia-Kazakhstan). Within the project a process management approach has been implemented for 74 public services. The process performance criteria have been identified as well as procedures for customer feed-back management. This project became the key step towards implementation of Self-assessment Model in the activity of public organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

This paper includes information based on following streams:

Stages of Implementation of Quality Management System in Public Service Sector

Within the last years the Government of Kazakhstan pays great attention to issues relating reformation of public administration system as well improvement of public service quality delivered to the population of the country. Increased quality and accessibility of public service were defined as one of the goals for administrative reform to be implemented in the Republic of Kazakhstan for the next few years. To address these issues the municipal authority bodies have been also involved. The population demonstrates great interest in public service quality delivered by government organizations as this impact their implementation of constitutional rights.

A project on automatization of 73 public services (Table 1) was successfully implemented by Letograf Ltd in synergy with InterCert Consulting Center Asia Ltd that is IAQMA member organization. The part of the services is delivered at the level of central government bodies and the rest – at the level of local executive authority bodies (Akimats) as well as by Centers for Public Service (CPS) in regional offices in the Republic of Kazakhstan

Table 1.

Государственные организации и услуги населению

№	Level of Government Organization	Number of Organizations	Number of Services
1.	Central Bodies for Public Administration (Ministries)	8	52
2.	Local (Municipal) Bodies for Public Administration (Astana, Almaty, Karaganda, Taraz)	4	21

Many representatives of both central ministries and local executive bodies (LEB) from the mentioned cities have contributed to successful implementation of the project.

The Letograf Ltd has gained considerable experience in successful implementation of automatization projects in many organizations lower to Ministry of Justice. It was important to properly describe the algorithm of delivery of each individual public service. To achieve this group of consultants spent a few months to analyze all the specific details related to delivery of appropriate public service by different central or local authority bodies.

Addressing Specific Issues in Creation of an Integrated Information System for CPSs and other Central and Local executive authority bodies of the Republic of Kazakhstan

To ensure appropriate understanding of the project goals a dedicated meeting was held by National Information Technology JSC (hereinafter NIT JSC) in collaboration with Letograf Ltd and IAQMA consultants. The meeting was attended by representatives of all interested central and local executive bodies from all the regions of Kazakhstan. A number of analysts have also participated in the meeting with the aim to explain the specifics in delivery of public service by different bodies. They have also presented their analysis outcomes and conclusions related to improvement of public service quality delivered to population of Kazakhstan.

Automatization of business processes associated with delivery of public service (Table 2) was considered as the main project goal. This task seemed quite feasible taking into consideration international practices in the field of «global computerization». The analysts were given a considerable workload: to examine central and local bodies with the view to get better understanding of the future automatization processes (GB) as well as local/municipal executive bodies (LEB) and the service providers in particular. A number of analytical reports were eventually produced based on the results of the study.

Table 2

The Goals of Public Service Delivery Automatization

№	Name of Activity	Goal
1.	Reduction of paper documents	Reduction of bureaucracy; Saving time necessary for people to collect their input documents
2.	Creation of an integrated information resource	A faster search of necessary input documents; an elimination of necessity to address their queries to different public organizations
3.	Enabling the population to submit their queries and applications electronically	Decreased time for application submission

4.	Formalization of business processes of public organizations that deliver their services to the population	Optimization of public organizations' activity; Faster service delivery to the population
5.	Analysis of public service quality delivered to the population	Improvement of public service quality delivered to the population.

A list of services to be examined/studied as well as a draft work schedule was initially defined by the project terms and conditions. The study included visiting different government bodies and employee survey. In the course of the study the analysts had to identify complete data and information on the services delivered (the employee structure, public service delivery processes, the level of their automatization etc). Based on the study outcomes the analysts were first requested to develop the progress report and then final one for each individual service.

Selection of methodology for self-assessment of public service delivery performance.

Prior to the project implementation a task group of analysts has discussed the requirements to questionnaire forms with all the stakeholders. The survey was focused on both the employees of public organizations and population. In total 4 types of questionnaires have been established: 1 - «Information on availability of organizational database»; 2 - «Information on organizational integrated and centralize database»; 3 - «Information on public services delivered»; 4 - «Information on employees and technical support»; A specific attention has been paid to development of a questionnaire form used by analysts in the course of interviews. The form included a list of 32 public services (Table 3).

Table 3.

General Requirements to Questionnaire forms on Public Service Automatization

№	Questions
1.	Name of the Public Service
2.	Professional recommendations on optimization of public service delivery
3.	Legislative Foundation for PS delivery
4.	Availability of standards for the PS
5.	Internal organizational normative base for PS delivery
6.	PS classification (paid or free of charge)
7.	Time-frame for query processing and PS delivery
8.	Name of the document that is issued as a result of PS delivery
9.	Description of a structure and requirements to the content of the document issued
10.	Description of requirements to filling in the application forms by the populations
11.	Information on availability of electronic document archive
12.	Description of identified nonconformities in document preparation
13.	Typical reports to be submitted to superior bodies on PS delivery
14.	The level of PS automatization
15.	Availability of database on a status of PS delivery process
16.	Availability of Information system
17.	Availability of Information system developer
18.	Date of information system implementation
19.	Availability of services delivered through portal and gateway of e-government system

The following recommendations have been followed in the course of project on creation of automated system:

- to evaluate public service quality from the viewpoint of the population;
- to identify opportunities for achieving decreased time-frame for public service delivery;
- to optimize business processes related to public service delivery.

Concurrently with examination of different algorithms of public service delivery a number of questionnaire forms have been distributed by the analysts amongst central and local executive bodies of the Republic of Kazakhstan that deliver the public services.

In accordance with agreement achieved between all stakeholders it was decided to amend the questionnaire form No 3 through addition of PS delivery process chart as well as indication of the service and public body's name. A few changes were made to the text body of the document. An identification code was assigned to each service. For instance: the public service for "Issuance of passports and personal ID cards to citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan» was denoted as MU_A3_PS_1_Issuance of Passports and personal ID cards to citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan.doc etc.

Prior to beginning of the study each analyst had to achieve better understanding of standard for delivery of specific public service, develop the business process chart and follow approved instructions related to filling in questionnaire form. The document was completed by the analyst in the course of interviews with central government or municipal executive bodies' personnel. Once the study has been closed such a questionnaire form was signed by the both parties. In the study the government body had to submit different application samples based on which the public services to be delivered as well as documents that represent the result of the service delivery. All the collected materials and documents have been given proper analysis and classification. The materials of each case included a questionnaire form, sample documents, a public service delivery process chart agreed with the examined party, the standard and other documents relating the service. In addition each analyst had to make a photocopy of the study materials to create electronic version of the work outcomes.

A joint meeting for the software developers and analysts was held on a daily basis in the end of each working day where the results of the study were discussed and summarized. Necessary decisions were also made on improvement of working methods and action planning for the next day.

Project Scope (what public administration bodies have been covered by the project)

In particular the following organizations can be mentioned: Prosecutor General's Office of the Republic of Kazakhstan (PGO); Ministry of Justice (MJ), Ministry of Defence (MD), Ministry of Transportation and Communications (MTC); Ministry of Telecommunication and Information (MTI), Ministry of Internal Affairs (MIA), Ministry of Agriculture (MA), Ministry of Science and Education (MSE); Agency for Land Resource Management (ALRM); Local Executive Bodies (LEB);

In total 45 types of public services delivered by central bodies of public administration have been studied and examined as follows: MJ -20, MD – 5, ALRM – 4, MTC – 6, MTI – 2, MIA – 1, PGO – 2, 4 – MA and 1 MSE. The analysis of public services was carried out in Akimats of Jambil, Karaganda and Almaty regions. A specified set of public services delivered by local executive authority bodies was assigned to each analyst.

To collect the most complete information for each service it was decided to examine the same services delivered by local executive bodies in several regions at the same time. The task was to

define specific features related to delivery of each service locally. In addition a new task was received from the customer to carry out a repeated examination of 4 public services delivered by the Agency for Land Resource Management through local executive bodies in Almaty, Karaganda and Taraz regions. In fact the Agency itself is a developer of specific standards as well as ensures quality control of public service delivery. It was revealed in the course of examination that the service delivery process was recently outsourced to local executive bodies.

The study carried out in Astana city administration has indicated that the public services under examination are not delivered in full by the local executive body. Such undelivered public services included: PS - «Provision of social assistance in terms of fuel acquisition to specialists of social service that reside in rural areas»; PS - «Issuance of certificates on availability of personal farms»; PS - «Acceptance of an applications from those families willing to adopt children for patronage».

Challenges in the project implementation

The project team had to carry out huge routing workload including repeated visiting the same government bodies, negotiations with responsible employees, requests of additional information, clarification of the public service delivery processes and details: who is the service provider? Who is the customer? It was also necessary to identify categories of customers that received paid or free service; what is the structure of documentation to be enclosed to the application? What is the deadline for urgent document preparation? A few disagreements have been identified as a result of examination. For instance, option 1 – where the applicant is served through centers for public service (CPS); option 2 – where applicant is served directly by the some central government body.

The analysts had to deal with a wide range of practical issues: what additional documents are required from the applicant with consideration of territory specifics; what is the model for public service delivery; what is the time-frame for the service delivery (both through Centers for Public Service and Government Body); service costs; description of service delivery process with role indication; reasons for no delivery of the public service; regulation for numbering incoming documents; output documents; regulation for numbering outgoing documents; legislative base etc.

In fact the analysts of the project have collected considerable volumes of information that was necessary for automatization. In accordance with the Statement by Ministry of Communication and Information of the Republic of Kazakhstan № 10-02-37/2868 and 8.10.2010. All the central and local executive bodies were requested to submit to the ministry their completed questionnaire forms No 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 before 20 of October 2010 with the aim to examine and analysis of public service delivery business processes and information systems involved.

In total 1824 questionnaire forms completed have been submitted by the central and local government bodies. All the documents were photocopied and sent to the customer electronically. The questionnaire forms have been registered and submitted to the project leader for consideration and analysis. In line with the customer task a part of information was entered into the database through Dropbox software.

In the end of the project all the questionnaire forms have been arranged as individual cases and submitted to interested government organizations. Over 53 registers with the forms received from different government as well as questionnaire forms completed by the analysts in the course of the public service examination were provided. In the course of the study a few inaccuracies were identified in the names of public services as well as services that were

excluded or added to the amended list of public services. Thus a Public Service «Registration of original legal document (notarized copies) marked by the registration body (on rights /encumbrance registration) for real estate and transactions» - was added to the list and delivered in accordance with the standard - «government registration of rights» (encumbrances) for real estate and transactions».

The public service - «Registration of unemployed citizens» has been also included into the list of public services subject to examination with further connection to integrated and centralized database. There are many of such examples which could be mentioned. Thus this project was of all-round benefits and value for improvement of public services. Payment issues were also considered with regard to services delivered in standard manner as well as urgent document preparation: 1st category - 15 days; 2nd 10 days and 3rd 7 days).

In the course of project implementation it was found that 37 public services were delivered free of charge, including: removal of citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan from the register; registration and removal of military reserve officers; registration and removal of sergeants; registration and sequence of citizens provided with the housing from government fund; issuance of certificates for acquisition of household equipment based on leasing conditions; acceptance of applications from those families willing to adopt children for patronage; issuance of a certificate on availability or clean records etc. It was also established that 11 of 73 public services were not delivered through centers for public service.

Practical recommendations developed as a result of the project implementation

It was necessary to analyze the entire list of documents submitted by applicants to receive a specific public service. The analysis showed that when applying for different government bodies the applicant in general has to submit the same documents. A list of documents has been developed for exclusion from submission as those documents were available in the addressed organizations that deliver public services. It is now not necessary to submit a document repeatedly as all the information is entered into the appropriate database. This enables the population to considerable save their time when applying to government/ public organizations.

A recommendation was also proposed by project analysts to exclude those documents requested by all government bodies for service delivery. A list of public services was produced as a result of which the applicants do not receive any output document. These services are delivered so that applicant could obtain other documents. Now when preparing for the service delivery the government organizations exchange the documents with each other. In total there were 15 such services identified.

In summary a conclusion was made on practical need for such projects that imply a profound examination of each public service with the aim to improve them for the society. It should be noted here that it would be inappropriate to count on resolving all the issues relating quality improvement of public services as there are still many challenges in this industry. Therefore there may be a hope that a good start was placed in this activity and the government of Kazakhstan as well as leaders of public administration bodies would continually improve their service quality delivered to the population and methodology with consideration of global experience in this field.

Conclusions.

As a result of optimization and automatization of public service delivery to the population of Kazakhstan the following goals have been achieved:

1. Reduction of the list of documents to be submitted for a public service delivery as the same documents are available at the service providers.
2. Exclusion of the documents requested by all the government bodies when delivering their service. Now the organizations submit them to each other when preparing their services. There are 15 such services.
3. As a result of automatization of 74 public services the number of public organizations that deliver their services to the population was reduced;
4. The number of public services delivered to the population without their mandatory application to the organizations was increased. This can be now done on-line;
5. Considerable time-saving was achieved for public service delivery to the population.
6. The level of bureaucracy was decreased where any public service is delivered. The risk of corruption in government organizations was reduced;

Source:

- **Hans de Bruijn: "Managing Performance in the Public sector", 2002**
- **Gary Cokins: "Performance Management", 2004**
- **Tito Conti: "Organizational Self-Assessment", 1997**